

A Brief Feedback Intervention for Diagnostic Overshadowing

Wood D.S., Tracey T.J.G.

Arizona State University

Abstract: Clinical decision-making errors are well-documented among both experienced clinicians and students. One robust clinical decision-making error is called diagnostic overshadowing (DO), which occurs when the presence of one diagnosis interferes with the detection of other diagnoses. This study tested whether two types of instruction and brief feedback interventions reduced the likelihood of DO. Specifically, content-based feedback and principle-based feedback significantly reduced the likelihood of DO among doctoral students in clinical and counseling psychology (N = 220). An intervention effect was found when the training task and the target task were highly similar. Recommendations for improving diagnostic decision-making among trainees in professional psychology are discussed. © 2009 American Psychological Association.

Author Keywords: clinical decision-making; diagnostic overshadowing; feedback; psychodiagnosis; training in professional psychology

Year: 2009

Source title: Training and Education in Professional Psychology

Volume: 3

Issue: 4

Page : 218-225

Link: [Scopus Link](#)

Document Type: Article

Source: Scopus

Authors with affiliations:

1. Wood, D.S., Arizona State University
2. Tracey, T.J.G., Arizona State University

References:

1. Alford, J.D., Locke, B.J., Clinical responses to psychopathology of mentally retarded persons (1984) *American Journal of Mental Deficiency*, 89, pp. 195-197
2. (2000) *Diagnostic and statistical manual of mental disorders*. 4th ed., text revision, , American Psychiatric Association, Author, Washington, DC
3. Ananth, J., Vandewater, S., Kamal, M., Brodsky, A., Missed diagnosis of substance abuse in psychiatric patients (1989) *Hospital and Community Psychiatry*, 40, pp. 297-299
4. Bieri, J., Atkins, A.L., Briar, S., Leaman, R.L., Miller, H., Tripodi, T., (1966) *Clinical and social judgment: The discrimination of behavioral information*, , Wiley, New York
5. Dawes, R.M., (1994) *House of cards: Psychology and psychotherapy built on myth*, , Free Press, New York
6. Driscoll, M.P., (2000) *Psychology of learning for instruction*. 2nd ed., , Allyn & Bacon, Needham Heights, MA

7. Fals-Stewart, W., Angarano, K., Obsessive-compulsive disorder among patients entering substance abuse treatment: Prevalence and accuracy of diagnosis (1994) *Journal of Nervous and Mental Disease*, 182, pp. 715-719
8. Fauman, M.A., (2002) *Study guide to DSM-IV-TR*, American Psychiatric Association, Washington DC
9. Faust, D., Research on human judgment and its application to clinical practice (1986) *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice*, 17, pp. 420-430
10. First, M.B., Frances, A., Pincus, H.A., (2002) *DSM-IV-TR: Handbook of differential diagnosis*, American Psychiatric Association, Washington DC
11. Garb, H.N., Clinical judgment, clinical training, and professional experience (1989) *Psychological Bulletin*, 105, pp. 387-396
12. Garb, H.N., The representativeness and past-behavior heuristics in clinical judgment (1996) *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice*, 27, pp. 272-277
13. Garb, H.N., (1998) *Studying the clinician: Judgment research and psychological assessment*, American Psychological Association, Washington, DC
14. Garb, H.N., Schramke, C.J., Judgment research and neuropsychological assessment: A narrative review and meta-analyses (1996) *Psychological Bulletin*, 120, pp. 140-153
15. Garner, W.A., Strohmer, D.C., Langford, C.A., Boas, G.J., Diagnostic and treatment overshadowing bias across disabilities: Are rehabilitation professionals immune? (1994) *Journal of Applied Rehabilitation Counseling*, 25, pp. 33-37
16. Goethe, J.W., Ahmadi, K.S., Comparison of diagnostic interview schedule to psychiatrist diagnoses of alcohol use disorder in psychiatric inpatients (1991) *American Journal of Drug and Alcohol Abuse*, 17, pp. 61-69
17. Goldsmith, L., Schloss, P.J., Diagnostic overshadowing among learning disabled and hearing impaired learners with an apparent secondary diagnosis of behavior disorders (1984) *International Journal of Partial Hospitalization*, 2, pp. 209-217
18. Gosling, S.D., Vazire, S., Srivastava, S., John, O.P., Should we trust web-based studies? A comparative analysis of six preconceptions about internet questionnaires (2004) *American Psychologist*, 59, pp. 93-104
19. Hurley, A.D., Sovner, R., Six cases of patients with mental retardation who have antisocial personality disorder (1995) *Psychiatric Services*, 8, pp. 828-831
20. Kahneman, D., Tversky, A., On the psychology of prediction (1974) *Psychological Review*, 80, pp. 237-251
21. Kranzler, H.R., Kadden, R.M., Bureson, J.A., Babor, T.F., Apter, A., Rounsaville, B.J., Validity of psychiatric diagnoses in patients with substance use disorders: Is the interview more important than the interviewer? (1995) *Comprehensive Psychiatry*, 36, pp. 278-288
22. Lambert, M.J., Hansen, N.B., Finch, A.E., Patient-focused research: Using patient outcome data to enhance treatment effects (2001) *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*, 69, pp. 159-172
23. Levitan, G.W., Reiss, S., Generality of diagnostic overshadowing across disciplines (1983) *Applied Research in Mental Retardation*, 4, pp. 59-64
24. Lopez, S.R., Patient variable biases in clinical judgment: Conceptual overview and methodological considerations (1989) *Psychological Bulletin*, 106, pp. 184-203
25. Meehl, P.E., The cognitive activity of the clinician (1960) *American Psychologist*, 15, pp. 19-27
26. Morrison, J., (2000) *DSM-IV made easy*, Guilford Press, New York
27. Plous, S. (n.d.). Ranking of clinical psychology programs in the U.S. and Canada. Retrieved December 10, 2003, from <http://www.socialpsychology.org/clinrank.htm>
28. Riemann, B.C., McNally, R.J., Cox, W.M., The comorbidity of obsessive-compulsive disorder and alcoholism (1992) *Journal of Anxiety Disorder*, 6, pp. 105-110
29. Reiss, S., Levitan, G.W., Szysko, J., Emotional disturbance and mental retardation: Diagnostic overshadowing (1982) *American Journal on Mental Deficiency*, 86, pp. 567-574

29. Reiss, S., Szysko, J., Diagnostic overshadowing and professional experience with mentally retarded persons (1983) *American Journal on Mental Deficiency*, 87, pp. 396-402
30. Skodol, A.E., Williams, J.B.W., Spitzer, R.L., Gibbon, M., Kass, F., Identifying common errors in the use of DSM-III through diagnostic supervision (1984) *Hospital and Community Psychiatry*, 35, pp. 251-255
31. Spengler, P.M., Strohmer, D.C., Clinical judgmental biases: The moderating roles of counselor cognitive complexity and counselor client preferences (1994) *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 41, pp. 1-10
32. Spengler, P.M., Strohmer, D.C., Prout, H.T., Testing the robustness of the overshadowing bias (1990) *American Journal on Mental Retardation*, 95, pp. 204-214
33. Tracey, T.J.G., Rounds, J., Inference and attribution errors in test interpretation (1999) *Test interpretation: Integrating science and practice*, pp. 113-131. , Goodyear R.K., and Lichtenberg J.W. (Eds), Allyn & Bacon, Boston
34. Tranebjærg, L., Orum, A., Major depressive disorder as a prominent but underestimated feature of fragile X syndrome (1991) *Comprehensive Psychiatry*, 32, pp. 83-87
35. White, M.J., Nichols, C.N., Cook, R.S., Spengler, P.M., Walker, B.S., Look, K.K., Diagnostic overshadowing and mental retardation: A meta-analysis (1995) *American Journal on Mental Retardation*, 100, pp. 293-298